

COMMENTS AND RESPONSE REPORT

THE PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT OF PORTION 1 OF THE FARM MATJESFONTEIN 206, BAVIAANSKLOOF, WILLOWMORE, EASTERN CAPE



COMMENT	ORGANISATION/NAME/DATE	RESPONSE
Further to my recent telephone conversation with you, as requested herewith some of my concerns regarding the development envisaged on the farm Matjiesfontein.	RietRivier - Boetie Terblanche 27 July 2020	Thank You
In your "Pre-Application Basic Assessment Report" it is stipulated that you expect the construction of each unit to take around 3 months and that only one unit will be constructed at a time. In other words, it is estimated that it will take around 30 months to construct 10 units. What this translates to is 30 months of supply, construction and workforce travel on the road from the main road R332 to the Matjiesfontein construction site. All this traffic will be passing through a 4km stretch of road on my farm, past my residence and past my tourist accommodation. This road also follows along a deep "kloof" which results in significant noise echo from all vehicles travelling along it.		<p>Please note that in the Pre-APP BAR, the template poses the Question: <u>How many new employment opportunities will be created in the development phase of the activity?</u></p> <p>The report response is: "In an urban environment it takes approximately 15 labourers approximately 4 months to construct one house, therefore, 15 labourers x 4 months x 20 day work month, results in approximately 1200 man days to construct a house.</p> <p>The new job opportunities will however be dependent on the individual owner and his budget and time frames, in addition to the willingness and skill set of the local labour to complete the work."</p> <p>The time frames are calculated linearly purely for ease of reading and to try quantify how many Jobs can potential be created, in the urban environment and as indicated, it does not take other factors into account. If more labour is used at any</p>

COMMENTS AND RESPONSE REPORT

THE PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT OF PORTION 1 OF THE FARM MATJESFONTEIN 206, BAVIAANSKLOOF,
WILLOWMORE, EASTERN CAPE



		<p>given moment then that time frame will be divided by the amount of labour used.</p> <p>The times frames for that calculation is intended to indicate possible work opportunities are not for time frames purposes.</p> <p>Clarity regarding the construction phase time frames will be included into the final BAR.</p> <p>All reasonable steps will be taken to minimize noise during the construction phase. The road ranges from between 100m from your nearest accommodation to 300m from your furthest accommodation. We agree that while your guests will hear the vehicles making use of the road from time to time, this is unlikely to have an impact on their experience due to the infrequent vehicle movement volumes. Currently the traffic from farming activities is not applicable because the farm is not actively farmed. However, guests to the Leopard trail do use the same road up the kloof.</p>
<p>My concern also relates to once the construction is completed and the ongoing maintenance that would be required for the significant number of new units and the traffic that this may result in – all still having to make</p>		<p>It is not likely that there will be ongoing maintenance but instead when and as is needed, we therefore don't see that the volume will be significant. The right of way</p>

COMMENTS AND RESPONSE REPORT

THE PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT OF PORTION 1 OF THE FARM MATJESFONTEIN 206, BAVIAANSKLOOF, WILLOWMORE, EASTERN CAPE



use of the road through my farm. <i>I see no mention of any impact study regarding this matters in your report?</i>		road through the property to access Portion 1 of farm 206 is the only reasonable access route to the property.
I wish to place on record that there is and has always been an amicable relationship with Mr Booth and his family and I have a good relationship with his long standing staff, whom we have always assisted when and where we can – especially when the road floods and becomes impassable for their vehicles. I further place on record that we have never had issue with the normal course of the guests traveling to the Leopard trail and guest accommodation on the Matjiesfontein farm.		This is good to hear because we believe that the traffic will not increase significantly, and any minor concerns should be able to be resolved. We presume with the 7 units and 48 guests that can be accommodated at Makkedaat caves the traffic has not been a problem in the past which could not be resolved through negotiations.
We live in a very beautiful part of South Africa, but an area that is also very environmentally sensitive (being a World Heritage Site) and even more importantly being a critical water catchment area for the Kouga Dam and all communities further down the Kloof. To highlight this sensitivity, the Riet Rivier (the kloof in which the road in question is located) is the largest water source (catchment area) within the Kouga Mountains and that feeds the BaviaansKloof and its river – this must carefully be considered in all this planning.		<p>The proposed activities will be aligned with the property's water rights and if required an amendment of the Water Use Licences will be undertaken.</p> <p>The units will be placed outside of the riverine area. The road is within this environment and has been used for many years without appearing to have any detrimental effect.</p> <p>The expected daily household water needs are far less than what could be used to irrigate fields with.</p>
My further concern regarding the impact on the water course is as follows: The water source (open natural spring) that supplies the drinking water for my farm (20 people) and also for on average 9 guests per day/evening all originates		The entire Portion 1 of the Farm Matjiesfontein 206, is located upstream, the water use of the property will comply with the relevant conditions of the water

COMMENTS AND RESPONSE REPORT

THE PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT OF PORTION 1 OF THE FARM MATJESFONTEIN 206, BAVIAANSKLOOF, WILLOWMORE, EASTERN CAPE



in this open spring. According to your report and the plans listed therein, 4 of the proposed accommodation units are located directly upstream from this sensitive and critical water supply.		use licence. Where is your spring which you use for drinking water located and do all 48 guests and your labourers use this spring?
Also attached is a letter from the workers and residents on Rietrivier for your information and consideration.		The content of the letter is included below these comments
The above is an extract of the more pressing concerns I have regarding the proposed developments on the farm Matjiesfontein and certainly does not encompass the full list of my questions and apprehensions regarding this proposed development not to mention my disagreement with a good amount of the information presented in your report.		Following this comment, we requested that any other comments be submitted so that they can be considered during this Basic Assessment Process. Additional comments were received and have been included below.
I trust that this correspondence will allow us all an opportunity to open dialogue that will result in a positive, progressive and fair outcome for all the parties affected by this matter under discussion. Looking forward to your feedback Wishing you well		That is one of the points of public participation.
Geagte Mnr. Die Ontwikkelaar <u>Insake: Versekering van ons werk</u> Ek skryf hierdie brief in verband met die uitbreiding op Matjiesfontein (ceder falls). Ek skryf namens my werkspan op Rietrivier. Ons wil weet terwyl daar uit gebrei word op Matjiesfontein of dit ons	Rietrivier werkspan Estelle Meiring Fredrick Jordaan Peres Maganie Sarah Meiring Willem Maganie	There will be an increase in vehicle movements to and from the property especially during the construction phase however it would not be to the extent that trucks will be utilizing the road every day. Materials will be dropped off and then only replenished once finished. The movement of labourers to site, if they will not be

COMMENTS AND RESPONSE REPORT

THE PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT OF PORTION 1 OF THE FARM MATJESFONTEIN 206, BAVIAANSKLOOF, WILLOWMORE, EASTERN CAPE



<p>gaan benadeel. Hulle gaan gebruik maak van die pad wat ons gebruik wanneer ons grotte toe moet gaan om skoon te maak. Ons gaste weet dat ons wêreld 'n rustige en stil plek is, maar as daar begin om te bou gaan word, dan gaan die pad besig raak en dan verstaan ons gaste nie wat aangaan nie. Hulle gaan bang is om te beweeg, want soos ons weet dat stads – mense dink aan steel, inbraak, moord en allerhande snaakse goed, wat met hulle kan gebeur. Dan beteken dit dat ons werkgewer nie meer gaste gaan ontvang nie, want hulle gaan bang wees oor wat met hulle kan gebeur as hulle hier by ons kom slaap. Dan gaan die werkgewer ons moet laat gaan, want dan is daar nie meer vir ons werk nie. Ek werk +- vyf jaar al hier en dan is daar een wat meer as elf jaar hier werk en wat vier kinders en 'n vrou het wat hy moet onderhou. Ek self het 'n kind wat ek moet voor sorg. En as ek my werk gaan verloor hoe gemaak dan. As ek 'n voorstel kan maak sal ek sê hulle moet die pad van Matjiesfontein na Boskloof toe, op die berg regmaak. Dan kan hulle daar deur ry met die uitbrei projek. En dan kan Matjiesfontein van die pad gebruik maak as hul leopard – trail. Iets wat kan</p>	<p>Pearl Meiring Michelle/Paswell/Ruano/Stefan/Erren Ellestien Meiring</p> <p>27 July 2020</p>	<p>staying on site, will not exceed the usual traffic associated with staff going to work on a farm. We believe that the existing right of access road to the property has been in use for about 100 years.</p> <p>The closest proposed construction site is approximately 1.6 km from the boundary of the farming property after crossing an additional property, and approximately 2.5km from the nearest cave accommodation.</p> <p>It is highly likely that makdaat caves will receive more guests in the long term due to the increased awareness of the accommodation created by guests visiting Matjiesfontein.</p> <p>It is incorrect to assume that all labourers are thieves and murders, without labourers there would be no development and economic growth and we do not think “stads-mense” think this is the case.</p> <p>There will jobs available during the construction phase and operational phase of the proposal.</p> <p>We understand that the existing road has been in use for more than 100 years, the</p>
---	--	--

COMMENTS AND RESPONSE REPORT

THE PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT OF PORTION 1 OF THE FARM MATJESFONTEIN 206, BAVIAANSKLOOF, WILLOWMORE, EASTERN CAPE



<p>help is dat die Leopard trail dan sy eie ingangs hek kan hê wat baie sal help vir toekomstige gaste. So ons as Rietrivier werkspan wil hê dat Mnr. Ontwikkelaar ons behoefde ook raak sien of het u hulle dalk vir ons werk as ons sonder werk sit as Rietrivier se deure moet toe maak. Terwyl u aan uitbreiding dink, beplan ook vir ons 'n taxi vir ons vervoer na U.</p>		<p>proponent has a legal right to use that road to access his property.</p> <p>It is unclear what the purpose of your comment regarding a taxi or what relevance it has to this environmental process.</p>
<p>Aan wie hierdie inligting mag benodig.</p> <p>Vanaf I.W Terblanche (Down Stream) buurman & plaas van Matjiesfontein:</p> <p>1) Volgens my inligting kontrakteer Matjiesfontein (Leopard trail) mense vanaf Willowmore; by name Stephan & Katie en ander vir onderhoud aan Leopard trail; so:!!! geen (Locals) beskikbaar uit Baviaanskloof nie: Nou wil ek weet!: die konstruksies wat gedoen moet word op Matjiesfontein ; Waar sal die (locals) vandaan kom: Dit is juis hierop dat ek 'n problem sien vir (1) Nou (2)toekoms met vreemde (mense) (arbeiders) bestuurders (tale) Kulture: Gelowe van watter Nasionaleiteit of groep of groepe dit ook mag wees; Selfs blankes ingesluit Ek bevestig weer; Soos voorheen</p>	<p>RietRivier - Boetie Terblanche</p> <p>20 August 2020</p>	<p>Willowmore is part of the Beyers Naude Municipality and is therefore regarded as part of the local community. Preference will be given to those within the local municipality and whom are from a previously disadvantaged background. If there is however not enough labour available from the local municipality then labour can/will be sourced from elsewhere.</p> <p>There will be no discrimination against people of different cultures or nationalities. The landowner has the right to allow anyone onto his property no matter their culture or nationality.</p>

COMMENTS AND RESPONSE REPORT

THE PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT OF PORTION 1 OF THE FARM MATJESFONTEIN 206, BAVIAANSKLOOF, WILLOWMORE, EASTERN CAPE



<p>genoem; geskrywe; verduidelik...Ek het geen probleem met die <u>huidige</u> mense nie!!!</p>		
<p>Soos in Report sal (1) een Unit 3 maande duur om te Bou: dit wil sê +- 10 Units sal 30 Maande duur; want met (Locals) Kan alles nie gelyktydig gedoen word nie: 30 Maande (1) Konstruksie bakkies (2) (Heavy) voertuie vir materiaal (3) personeel voertuie: Na Konstruksie en tydens Konstruksie vir onderhoud; verandering Verbeteringe en personeel na Konstruksie Beweeg, alle bogenoemde Personeel + voertuie vir 4 kilometer, deur Rietrivier se akkomodasie wat dierek (direk) Langs hierdie pad geleë is: dit is 'n (narrow) Nou kloof met 'n (Klip pad) nie teer of Sement of gegruis afgerol of gekompakteer nie; Alles hierdie geraas is onbepaalbaar; dit gaan 'n geraaspeil ontwikkel wat die vrede, Stilte en gevoel van veiligheid geheel en al sal verwoes. Toerisme, Gaste + Besoekers sal afskrik.</p>		<p>As indicated in the comments above the timeframes to construct the units was used to try determine how many man hours will be potentially available to determine the amount of job opportunities.</p> <p>Once construction commences and only if the labourers do not stay on the site during the construction phase, there will likely be one or two vehicles in the morning and afternoon to take labourers to and from work. A truck will not be used everyday to drop off materials but more realistically at a far lower frequency, probably one a week.</p> <p>The units may only be constructed over a ten year period so it is likely that in some months or even years there will be no construction traffic. In the conditions of approval for your existing 7 accommodation units were there any mitigatory measures proposed? If so could you forward them on so that we can include them in our mitigatory measures in terms of noise and dust etc.</p>

COMMENTS AND RESPONSE REPORT

THE PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT OF PORTION 1 OF THE FARM MATJESFONTEIN 206, BAVIAANSKLOOF, WILLOWMORE, EASTERN CAPE



<p>Die geraas in Nou Kloof oor 'n pad met klippe (Boulders) en Rocks Kan nie positief wees nie. Die (oog) (eye) (kring) vanwaar Rietrivier se drinkwater verky word; Begin 500 meters downstream (Noord) vanaf hierdie ontwikkeling op Matjiesfontein. Hierdie oop Kanaal; begin van waterbron kan Nadelig beïnvloed word deur (1) Sewrage (2) Litter gedurende 'n storm & Brakedown van Sisteme: Gemiddeld 28 persone per dag.</p>		<p>You are correct, noise impacts are not regarded as a positive.</p> <p>Mitigation measures in the EMPr will mitigate those potential litter impacts. A review of the EMPr would inform this, please provide any additional mitigation measures if in your opinion those within the EMPr are not sufficient to mitigate those potential impacts.</p> <p>It will be helpful if you provide the mitigatory measures as per your planning, environmental and water use licence approvals so that we can incorporate them into our mitigatory measures.</p>
<p>My probleem (Rietrivier) gaan nie kompetisie nie; (gaste) verblyf (units) die totale konsep verskil totaal; Baviaanskloof; het tans min misdaad ; geen plaasaanvalle nie +- 70% van persone in B.K. is ouer persone; wat juis in die vrede 'n stilte en veiligheid hier aftree (Retire).</p> <p>Hiermee 'n erinstige beroep op kontrakteurs van die "Leopard Trail" Maak gebruik van die pad na die tenke – kamps, wes van Matjiesfontein se opstal.</p>		<p>The proposed erven will be sold off and as such people visiting the property will likely be owners of the erven, whom may have the exact same idea to retire there.</p> <p>The property has an existing right of way access that is in a fair enough state for sedan vehicles to access the property. Providing access from a completely different kloof makes little sense especially when one considers the effort and expenses needed to build a new road to the property.</p>

COMMENTS AND RESPONSE REPORT

THE PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT OF PORTION 1 OF THE FARM MATJESFONTEIN 206, BAVIAANSKLOOF, WILLOWMORE, EASTERN CAPE



<p>Dit sal beteken dat die Leopard – Trail sy eie indraai pad sal hê en die hele probleem met die Makkedaat grotte opgelos sal wees; want dan sal julle nie deur ons akkommodasie plekke ry nie.</p> <p>Ook vir die toekoms sal julle baie spaar want dit sal jul arbeiders omtrent +- 16km spaar per rit as hul die tenkekampe moet skoonmaak of bagasie daarheen vervoer. Reken dit uit per maand en dan per jaar, besparing aan tyd en diesel geld per jaar!!! en ons leef almal in vrede saam, omdat albei parteie dan gelukkig sal wees.</p>		<p>The existing right of way access road to the property is best suited as it is currently functional and has been for many years and won't require a new road to be built. As we understand it the Makkedaat accommodation units have been built over the years with the full knowledge and understanding that the road serves as access to a fully functioning farmstead.</p>
<p>Dear Mr. Michael Bennett</p> <p>COMMENT ON THE BAR FOR THE PROPOSED REZONING AND SUBDIVISION OF PORTION 1 OF THE FARM MATJESFONTEIN 206, BAVIAANSKLOOF, WILLOWMORE, EASTERN CAPE</p> <p>Thank you for your e-mails and reminder regarding the public participation process in respect of the matter at hand.</p>	<p>Mark & Paulien Enrieu – Speekhout Farm Douglas & Elmari Seton – DuiweKloof Nico Smith – Uitspan</p> <p>24 August 2020</p>	<p>Thank you.</p>

**THE PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT OF PORTION 1 OF THE FARM MATJESFONTEIN 206, BAVIAANSKLOOF,
WILLOWMORE, EASTERN CAPE**

[illegible]

COMMENTS AND RESPONSE REPORT

THE PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT OF PORTION 1 OF THE FARM MATJESFONTEIN 206, BAVIAANSKLOOF, WILLOWMORE, EASTERN CAPE



<p>attracting a special visitor to its unique beauty. The individual farmers have maintained, and in a few instances, expanded their guest accommodation – but mostly it has remained the same number of units over the last years with the guest accommodation being old farm houses, or workers homes that have been lovingly restored and converted to accommodate guests. In some instances the natural landscape of the area and its features have been used to make totally unique and individualistic accommodation only really found in this area. The lifestyle and daily routine of the majority of landowners continuing and most of them still deriving their livelihoods from farming operations. The land on which they live and work, being family heritage and this is where most will retire and end their lives with their children continuing their families farming legacy.</p> <p>My wife & I bought and moved to the Baviaanskloof (Speekhout Farm) just over three years ago, being attracted to this part of the world because of its stark beauty, and natural isolation. We moved from a busy, overcrowded and crime filled city to what we knew was the total</p>		<p>.</p> <p>According to the Sarah Baartman District Municipality website:</p> <p>“The well-known Baviaanskloof Nature Reserve, a world heritage site and one of the largest wilderness areas in the country, is situated to the south. The nature reserve covers 90% of the local municipal area, which has been divided into four wards. The leading sectors with regard to Gross Value Added are community services, agriculture, trade (which includes tourism), finance (which includes real estate), manufacturing and transport. Agriculture, tourism and service industries form the basis of the area’s economy.</p> <p>Due to the world heritage site, the future economic development of this area is based on the development of tourism. The area consists of two urban nodes, various smaller settlements, a well-developed transportation network, farmlands and conservation areas. The Baviaans Municipality is a Category B Municipality, which together with another 8 municipalities, form the Sarah Baartman District Municipality. The Baviaans Municipal area is bordered on the North by Ikwezi Municipality, the East by Sundays</p>
--	--	---

COMMENTS AND RESPONSE REPORT

THE PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT OF PORTION 1 OF THE FARM MATJESFONTEIN 206, BAVIAANSKLOOF, WILLOWMORE, EASTERN CAPE



<p>opposite. We have three accommodation units that we receive guests at and we were, from the beginning, pleasantly surprised at the interest and number of tourists we accommodated annually. When moving to the farm we had no intention to continue with the tourist business and also had no plans to do any farming, however here we are 3 years down the line and we are deeply entrenched within the tourism aspect of the Baviaanskloof, us often commenting on the very special people we meet as guests to our farm. We have also been drawn head first into farming – never thinking that we would engage in this activity – but the beauty of the nature, the amazing clear fountain water was too tempting to resist and here we are with our own sheep and pigs and chickens and a bull and cow for our own milk and vegetables etc etc. And so we live and work and continue our lives in this most unique and beautiful part of the world, sharing this specialness with our amazing visitors and guests.</p> <p>For the farm Uitspan and its owner Nico Smith, it is much the same. Nico is a Kloof native with long family history here and he</p>		<p>River Valley Municipality, the South by Kou-Kamma and Kouga Municipalities and the West by the Eden District Municipality (Western Cape Province). The Baviaans Municipal area falls within the Greater Karoo area (one of the areas within the Sarah Baartman District Municipality that have similar geographical characteristics and requires similar geographical guidance). This area can be described as an area with:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Commercial farming area (sheep, goats and game); • Low population growth and density; • Water shortages; • Rich tourism potential not fully utilized e.g. Baviaanskloof Mega-Reserve; and • A high poverty rate.” <p>In addition, The five Development Priority areas identified in the 2017 - 2022 Sarah Baartman DM IDP are:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1: Basic Services delivery and Infrastructure development. 2: Good governance and Public participation. 3: Local Economic Development. 4: Municipal financial viability and management, and
---	--	---

COMMENTS AND RESPONSE REPORT

THE PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT OF PORTION 1 OF THE FARM MATJESFONTEIN 206, BAVIAANSKLOOF, WILLOWMORE, EASTERN CAPE



<p>also returned many years ago to this special part of the world to continue with his farming and now guest accommodation. Once again it is a farm where him and his family live and farm and then receive new and returning over years guests – as is the case with most of the family farms here.</p> <p>The farm DuiweKloof, which borders on our farm was established over 14 years ago by Dr Douglas Seton and his family. Resident in Oudtshoorn, Dr Seton originally established the lodge with numerous partners, but soon realised what a very special place this was and subsequently became the only owner. In discussion he indicated that he also very early on realised the fragile nature of this environment and that under no circumstances could it support a large resort development with a high throughput of people, thus his decision to remain the only owner and not develop further on his land. Even though he does not reside on the farm and at this stage it is exclusively for guest accommodation, the farm is a regular family gathering place and Dr Seton is already making plans to construct a residence for him and his wife</p>		<p>5: Municipal transformation and organizational development</p> <p>Under the third Development priority are, <i>“3: Local Economic Development”</i> <i>Objective 7: To grow the Tourism Sector’s absolute contribution to the District Economy.</i> <i>Objective 8: to position the District as a nationally-recognized tourism brand.</i></p> <p>As seen from the municipal planning document extracts above, although your personal views of tourism in the area are that of exclusivity, these are not in line with the municipal planning for the area. In addition it is not clear how the proposal will impact on the other tourism accommodation facilities as the property is not on the main road and one would have to literally drive onto the subject property to see the houses. The proposed erven will be sold to private owners and as such they may have the same intentions to buy into a piece of the beautiful landscape and area and have a house surrounded by World Heritage Site level vegetation that their grand kids can come visit them at. The new owners of the proposed erven may have the same intensions and dreams as yourself to retire in a quiet beautiful part of our South African Landscape, this is</p>
---	--	--

COMMENTS AND RESPONSE REPORT

THE PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT OF PORTION 1 OF THE FARM MATJESFONTEIN 206, BAVIAANSKLOOF, WILLOWMORE, EASTERN CAPE



<p>– he plans to move to the farm when he retires and live permanently in the Kloof.</p> <p>I believe the point I am getting to and wanting to clearly get across is this – the Baviaanskloof is unique and exclusive and what makes it what it is – is the nature and character of the places of accommodation for the tourists. Nearly ALL the places of accommodation in the Baviaanskloof are working farms and places of residence for their owners, who receive guests and tourists to their farms. The Kloof is not a commercial tourist centre or resort destination – but rather an exclusive unique adventure destination where you are welcomed by the owner to his piece of this beautiful paradise.</p> <p>When considering the plans put forward for the development of the farm Majtiesfontein, my heart is saddened and I am alarmed and the commerciality of the nature thereof. The proposals are completely out of character with the tourist accommodation that exists in the Kloof – and the exclusivity thereof. The sheer number of units that are proposed and the sheer scale of the undertaking is totally in contradiction to what is present</p>		<p>however up to the individual owners. As you note some people buy properties to retire and want to close down the accomodation units and farming practivies to the detriment of the people depending on them for work opportunities and others want to expand both tourism and accomodation opportunities. For example the Makkedaat Caves accommodation can sleep up to at least 48 people. The applicant does not want destroy the very ambiance that is so special to the Baviaanskloof</p> <p>The proposal will also compliment the world heritage status of the surrounding area as the fallow lands on the property will be managed to return to their natural state (indigenous vegetation). The World heritage status was due to the cape floristic kingdom, which will be better conserved if the proposal is approved as the intensions are to manage the property in same way as the surrounding world heritage site properties by allowing the indigenous vegetation to recover and removing any alien vegetation that may grow, amongst other things.</p> <p>The number of units for sale will be __ and the other units (4) will be provided to the labour as permanent residents. This</p>
--	--	---

COMMENTS AND RESPONSE REPORT

THE PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT OF PORTION 1 OF THE FARM MATJESFONTEIN 206, BAVIAANSKLOOF, WILLOWMORE, EASTERN CAPE



<p>in the Kloof and I believe will irreparably damage the image and exclusivity of what currently exists.</p> <p>Further adding to this, if we consider the character and quantity of accommodation within the Mega-Reserve itself, it also remains in character with that of the farms around it.</p>		<p>compares favorably to the 7 units which can accommodate at least 48 guests at Makkedaat caves accommodation.</p>
<p>NON VIABILITY OF FARMING OPERATIONS</p> <p>It is noted that comment is made that the present owner does not see the farm as being commercially viable for farming operations. The current situation of the farm not being viable for farming operations is NOT the fault of the land or the abundance of water thereon. The original farm was a very successful farm and lost its commercial viability due to the calculated actions of the current owner selling off land to Eastern Cape Parks and Tourism. It must thus be affirmed that justification for the current actions of the landowner cannot be given because of the consequences of a deliberate and pre-meditated earlier action.</p>		<p>The property which was sold has been included into the Cape Floristic Kingdom World Heritage site which is now owned and managed by a conservation body, well within the landowners rights. We agree that the bob viability of farming should not be used as a reason for providing the accommodation but the now conserved area which was sold off provides a value add to the accommodation and properties for sale.</p> <p>We concur with this statement.</p>

COMMENTS AND RESPONSE REPORT

THE PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT OF PORTION 1 OF THE FARM MATJESFONTEIN 206, BAVIAANSKLOOF, WILLOWMORE, EASTERN CAPE



<p>The current landowner has an active and viable tourist trade and has expanded well through the development and growth of the now popular Leopard Trail – which has and is currently undergoing significant improvement and expansion. This project in itself, one is certain, will generate significant new and increased tourist turnover.</p>		
<p>INVESTMENT IN LOCAL COMMUNITY</p> <p>Statements are made indicating that the landowner through his involvement with Another Way Trust has previously and is currently investing in the local/brown community and that this project will further support/uplift the local/brown community through upliftment projects. It has been noted from the current improvement project being undertaken by the landowner on the Leopard Trail and its infrastructure that the use of local/brown community labour is not being fulfilled. In fact it is quite noticeable that there is in fact foreign labour being used for the current project. Given this fact we seriously question the current landowners intention or even ability to source qualified community/brown, yet alone, local labour</p>		<p>Please note that reference is only made to local community, and not to the colour of their skin. In this case the municipal area is regarded as the local community which includes Willowmore.</p> <p>As mentioned in your previous comment, the property on which the Leopard Trail is located (apart from the start and finish) is owner by the ECPTA and the upgrades are being undertaken by ECPTA.</p> <p>It must be noted that preference is made to local labourer however if not enough local labour is available then other labour will be utilized. In addition, this report covers the proposal on the property and not the Leopard Trail which has been previously approved and operates on a neighboring property.</p>

COMMENTS AND RESPONSE REPORT

THE PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT OF PORTION 1 OF THE FARM MATJESFONTEIN 206, BAVIAANSKLOOF, WILLOWMORE, EASTERN CAPE



<p>to undertake construction of this scale. Therefor any benefit or upliftment that is intended for the local/brown community will be of no impact – and may even be to their detriment.</p> <p>This raises a further concern to us and the brown people as the community living within the Kloof, of foreign elements being introduced to the area with the ever threat of the ongoing crime and violence in our country. This especially taking into account attacks on famers and their families. What assurance can be given by the landowner and his contractors that any outside labour force that is used on this project will be properly vetted to ensure that a criminal element is not unleashed on this mostly crime free community?</p>		<p>Labourers will comply with the relevant regulations. However individual land owners who purchase a title in the scheme will be able to choose whichever builder they want. They will not be forced to use local builders if the skills they require for the construction are not present within the local labour.</p> <p>Currently any person living in anywhere in the Baviaanskloof or in South Africa for that matter may employ anyone, as long as they are in the country legally, to work for them. They do not have to give their neighbours assurances that the people they employ will not attack them. This will be the same situation in this case.</p>
<p>PROGRESSIVE LAND REFORM PROGRAM</p> <p>The undertaking by the landowner to provide loyal farm workers who have been working on the property for 10 years or more a resort erven is a mute point. Under regulations of the Extension of Security of Tenure Act of 1997 (and its subsequent additions and amendments) it is the legal obligation of the landowner to provide,</p>		<p>That is true however the security of tenure ensures the right to live on the property and protects the person from unfair evictions. As part of the proposal the labourers who qualify will be awarded a sellable asset and not just security of tenure. The qualifying labourer now not only has security for himself but also his immediate family and their children to come, these awarded erven could essentially become their families</p>

COMMENTS AND RESPONSE REPORT

THE PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT OF PORTION 1 OF THE FARM MATJESFONTEIN 206, BAVIAANSKLOOF, WILLOWMORE, EASTERN CAPE



<p>and thus the right of the workers and their families, to receive security of tenure of their places of accommodation on the property after a 10 year period of service. Thus, the tenure of these worker's places of residence on the property is not dependant on whether this development proceeds or not and can certainly not be regarded as a benefit to them should the development proceed.</p>		<p>inheritance and somewhere for them to retire.</p>
<p>CONCLUSION</p> <p>It is certainly not our intention as individuals or a community to stand in the way of progress or to afford the individual the right to earn a living. However there is also a responsibility on the individual to consider all those around him and his local community when undertaking a project of this scale – especially when a project is of such an enormous scale that it will certainly impact and change the lives of those surrounding the development.</p> <p>It is our opinion that the proposed plan is out of character with the true nature of the Baviaanskloof, it's community and the tourist genre that is so the Baviaanskloof.</p>		<p>It is still not clear exactly how the proposal will change or impact the lives of those surrounding the development, especially as the property is tucked away from the main road, with a few kilometers to travel through a narrow kloof before one even reaches the property. The kloof through which the road traverses also passes 7 accommodation units with a max capacity of 48 people.</p> <p>In terms of scale, all the farms in the area have a far greater footprint and area of disturbance to the natural environment than what is proposed on the subject property. The proposal will use far less water and will better conserve the World Heritage Status Cape Floristic Region vegetation.</p>

COMMENTS AND RESPONSE REPORT

THE PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT OF PORTION 1 OF THE FARM MATJESFONTEIN 206, BAVIAANSKLOOF, WILLOWMORE, EASTERN CAPE



<p>We believe that further discussion and adjustments need to be considered and deeper public input and participation is to be considered before any agreement can be considered with regards to this proposed development.</p>		<p>Each tourism facility in the baviaanskloof has its own unique setting and look, some in caves, some on farms, some in the kloofs, each with a different feel.</p> <p>It must be remembered that the public participation process is not about the popular vote on a project, rather it's about raising issues of concern. Therefore, you will need to specify if you have any further concerns than those that you have raised above.</p> <p>Thank you for your input.</p>
<p>Living Lands has been engaging and collaborating with various stakeholders in the Baviaanskloof landscape throughout the past 10 years, with the aim of continuing to do so in coming years. Founded upon relationships we have built with the people and environment itself during this time, we aim to take a holistic approach towards our work within this socio-ecological system to the benefit of the livelihoods of the area.</p> <p>It is appreciated that the proposed application could have an overall positive impact towards the tourism and appreciation of the local area. We propose taking a cautious approach to limit any impact on the greater Baviaanskloof</p>	<p>Justin Gird Living Lands</p> <p>24 August 2020</p>	<p>Thank you</p>

COMMENTS AND RESPONSE REPORT

THE PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT OF PORTION 1 OF THE FARM MATJESFONTEIN 206, BAVIAANSKLOOF, WILLOWMORE, EASTERN CAPE



community; kindly take note of the following comments pertaining specifically to Preferred Alternative 1:		
<p>Solid waste (section 11a): The proposed waste transport solution to the Willowmore landfill is not a responsible solution as said landfill site is already ill-managed and hazardous to its surroundings. The applicant is encouraged to include minimal waste, reuse and recycling as far as possible to reduce the footprint of the proposed development.</p>		<p>We concur with the need to recycle and minimize waste. The requirement for an integrated waste management approach forms part of the EMPr.</p> <p>In addition, the classification and disposal of waste will be in accordance with the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Waste generated on site must be classified and managed in accordance with the National Environmental Management: Waste Act – Waste Classification and Management Regulations (GN No. R. 634 of August 2013). • Disposal of waste to landfill must be undertaken in accordance with the National Environmental Management: Waste Act – National Norms and Standard for the Assessment of Waste for Landfill Disposal (GN No. R. 635 of August 2013).
<p>Water usage (section 12): We take note that there are unknowns documented about the volume of anticipated water use as well as the need of a water use permit from Department of Water Affairs. We recommend the inclusion of water recycling systems/greywater reuse as part of the development plan to make optimal use of a dwindling resource. There are more</p>		<p>All reasonable measures will be taken to minimize the impact on water resources.</p> <p>The property has existing water use rights, if the landowner were to start farming tomorrow he has the necessary water rights in place to abstract, within the limits of his water use licence, and irrigate his fields. The report indicates that clarity</p>

COMMENTS AND RESPONSE REPORT

THE PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT OF PORTION 1 OF THE FARM MATJESFONTEIN 206, BAVIAANSKLOOF, WILLOWMORE, EASTERN CAPE



than 15 down-stream property owners who all rely on the same, shared resource.		must be gained from water affairs regarding whether the existing licence must be converted for the proposal.
<p>Loss of indigenous vegetation (Section D, Table 1): The impact on indigenous vegetation will at least be Medium (-) for the 9 new footprints (3 on relatively undisturbed areas) based on the presented assessment criteria. Even with mitigation measures, the loss of vegetation will be significant due to its irreversible and unavoidable nature and the correctly listed consequences of impact or risk, namely: "Loss of indigenous vegetation, Loss of fauna habitat, Decrease in the site's erosion tolerance, Increased runoff from the site".</p> <p>The site's largely disturbed nature should not be seen as a reason why the impact should not be regarded as significant, but rather a motivation to keep further disturbance to a minimum.</p>		<p>According to the specialist report the impact on indigenous vegetation "<i>will be of low to medium significance due to the small scale of the project.</i>"</p> <p>This is because footprints 1-5 and 10-11 are located inside fallow land, while 6-9 are located in relatively undisturbed veld. Unit 8's footprint is located on a previously disturbed grass covered site. The proposed building footprint for each unit will be 250 m², which translates to a total area of 750 m² located inside undisturbed veld. The rest will be located inside fallow land or previously disturbed areas of low to medium sensitivity. The affected vegetation type, i.e. Baviaanskloof Shale Renosterveld, is not listed as threatened.</p> <p>In addition to the above the open spaces, fallow lands and agricultural fields will be managed to allow the re-establishment of indigenous vegetation which will result in a net gain of indigenous vegetation on the property over time. The impact tables cover the construction phase impacts however in the long term the proposal will be of a far greater positive than if agricultural activities were to continue.</p>

COMMENTS AND RESPONSE REPORT

THE PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT OF PORTION 1 OF THE FARM MATJESFONTEIN 206, BAVIAANSKLOOF, WILLOWMORE, EASTERN CAPE



As a general request, please include page numbers in all future reports to enable more specific commenting. We trust that you will consider our comments with sincerity and look forward to any feedback and information.		Thank you for your comments.
<p>1 Forestry is responsible for the implementation and the enforcement of the National Forest Act (NFA), Act 84 of 1998 as amended and the National Veld and Forest Fire Act, Act 101 of 1998 as amended (NVFFA). Thank you for giving Forestry this opportunity to comment on above application.</p> <p>2 Forestry studied the supporting documents for the above mentioned application and the following points related to Forestry's mandate i.e. the implementation of the NFA are applicable</p> <p>a. Kindly note, as you are well aware, above property falls within the Eastern Cape Province and the relevant Forestry Officials of that region should be given the opportunity to comment. Kindly make contact Deputy Director: Mrs. Gwendoline Sgwabe (GwendolineS@daff.gov.za) in order to enquire relevant Officials' details.</p> <p>b. As a general comment: kindly note that the Botanical Survey mentioned in your comments was not attached; should the Botanical survey</p>	DAFF	My apologies, the request to comment was sent to you by mistake as there is no forest component on the sites and therefore the National Forest Act (NFA), Act 84 of 1998 does not apply. Mrs Sgwabe will however be offered an opportunity to comment on the draft BAR.

COMMENTS AND RESPONSE REPORT

THE PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT OF PORTION 1 OF THE FARM MATJESFONTEIN 206, BAVIAANSKLOOF,
WILLOWMORE, EASTERN CAPE



be outdated it might be requested that a more recent as well as detailed Plant Species Assessment of above property be conducted by a Specialist and that this Specialist report be forwarded to the Department for perusal with ample photo record templates of the whole study area		
---	--	--