

# COMMENTS AND RESPONSES REPORT



## THE PROPOSED REMOVAL OF SAND BLOCKING A STORM WATER SUMP AT SUIDERKRUIS ON ERF 305, GREAT BRAK

COMMENT	NAME/ORGANISATION	RESPONSE
<p>I note the invitation to register as an interested and affected party, and I would like more information – particularly with regards to Figure 17 which discusses dumping sand at the river mouth.... Please could you explain this to me, as residents of The Island, together with SERAG and Mosselbay Municipality have spent a huge amount of money (to say nothing of time, and having mouth management plans drawn up and approved by the relevant parties), REMOVING sand from the river mouth area, so why would it now be 'dumped and spread' there?</p> <p>Please advise what the process is for objections.</p>	<p>Rose Williams 4 October 2023</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments. The Maintenance Management Plan has been amended and no sand will be moved to the river mouth. Please refer page 16 of the amended MMP.</p>
COMMENT	NAME/ORGANISATION	RESPONSE
<p>Before commenting on the MMP I would like to first thank Sharples Environmental Services for the initial work done on the MMP. The Great Brak River Conservancy acknowledges the importance of establishing a MMP for this area as the last time sump 1 was cleared very little consideration was taken for the dune, it's vegetation or the rehabilitation thereof both. This exercise resulted in approximately 2000m<sup>2</sup> of the dune adjacent sump 1 being unnecessarily disturbed by heavy machinery with zero recourse.</p> <p>The Great Brak River Conservancy would like to recommend that the outlet pipe of Sump 1 be extended. This will ultimately lead to less dune disturbance as less area would need to be dug and would need to be done so less frequently. The current position of the outlet pipe is located right below the highest part of a dune where due to sand volume and the dynamic nature of sand movement the outlet will inevitably be covered by sand. If the pipe was extended the dune could be allowed to reform over the pipe itself and the new outlet within the foredune would receive alot less sand covering it.</p>	<p>Scott Thomson Great Brak River Conservancy 5 October 2023</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments. The Maintenance Management Plan has been amended and no sand will be moved to the river mouth. Please refer page 16 of the amended MMP.</p>

<p>We would also like to draw your attention to the beach access point along Orion Drive within the gravel parking lot. This access point is closer to site than the proposed access point by the River mouth and would not interfere with the mouth and mouth management activities. We would also recommend that no sand be dumped at the river mouth area as this would have impact on both floodplain and sea berm heights as well as river mouth siltation.</p>		
<b>COMMENT</b>	<b>NAME/ORGANISATION</b>	<b>RESPONSE</b>
<p>I completely disagree with the dumping of the sand at the car park. Dumping sand near the river mouth, particularly next to the car park, raises several concerns and objections, as outlined below:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Precedent-setting: Allowing the dumping of sand sets a dangerous precedent. If one person or entity is allowed to do it, others may follow suit. This could lead to an uncontrolled proliferation of sand dumping, further exacerbating the problem.</li> <li>2. Environmental Impact: The prevailing easterly winds during the summer season can blow the dumped sand into the estuary and river. This poses a significant environmental concern as it can contribute to the salinification of the water. Increased salinity can harm aquatic life and disrupt the delicate balance of the ecosystem. Furthermore, raising sand levels in the river can lead to sedimentation and negatively impact water quality.</li> <li>3. Degradation of the River: Many resources, including private individuals' money, have been invested in efforts to open the river mouth and restore the river to a healthier state. Dumping sand near the river mouth runs counter to these restoration efforts and can undo the progress made towards rejuvenating the river ecosystem.</li> <li>4. Impact on Biodiversity: Dumping sand can disrupt the habitat of various aquatic species, including fish and other wildlife that rely on the river and estuary for their</li> </ol>	<p>Alexander Searle 10 October 2023</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments. The Maintenance Management Plan has been amended and no sand will be moved to the river mouth. Please refer page 16 of the amended MMP.</p> <p>The MMP must be approved by the Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning. No unauthorised moving or dumping of sand is permitted.</p> <p>Only a few truckloads of sand at most will be moved during a maintenance period.</p>

<p>survival. Increased sand levels can reduce the availability of food and breeding grounds for these species, potentially leading to a decline in biodiversity.</p> <p>5. Water Navigation: Higher sand levels in the river can make navigation difficult for boats. This can impede recreational activities. The increased need for dredging to maintain navigable waterways can be costly and environmentally damaging.</p> <p>6. Aesthetic and Recreational Concerns: The presence of excess sand near the river mouth can negatively impact the aesthetics of the area and deter visitors. A once-scenic location could become less appealing for tourism and recreation, affecting the local economy.</p> <p>7. Alternative Solutions: Instead of sand dumping, alternative solutions should be explored to address any issues related to beach erosion or other concerns. This might include carefully planned and regulated beach nourishment projects that take into account the environmental impact and the needs of the local community.</p> <p>8. Long-Term Consequences: It's important to consider the long-term consequences of sand dumping. While it may seem like a quick fix, it can have lasting and detrimental effects on the ecosystem, water quality, and the overall health of the river and estuary.</p> <p>In conclusion, the dumping of sand near the river mouth, especially next to the car park, poses significant environmental, ecological, and community-related concerns. It's essential to carefully assess the potential impacts and consider alternative solutions that are in line with conservation and restoration efforts for the river and its surroundings.</p> <p>I trust the above will be taken into consideration</p>		
<b>COMMENT</b>	<b>NAME/ORGANISATION</b>	<b>RESPONSE</b>
<p>Being a resident on the island and part of the founders of Great Brak River I OBJECT TO THE DUMPING OF SAND NEAR THE GREAT BRAK RIVER MOUTH!!!</p>	<p>LC Franklin 10 October 2023</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p>

<p>Please ensure that this is not DONE. We as residents constantly try to protect our river which was messed up by the Wolwedans Dam.</p> <p>Please confirm that this will not be done.</p> <p>We need to also find a way to rather get the Sewerage off the island !!! Any ideas on this please</p>		<p>The Maintenance Management Plan has been amended and no sand will be moved to the river mouth.</p> <p>Please refer page 16 of the amended MMP.</p>
COMMENT	NAME/ORGANISATION	RESPONSE
<p>It has come to my attention that you are promoting the dumping of sand in or near the Great Brak River mouth. As a resident of The Island, Grootbrakrivier I most strenuously object to any such plan. The river has been and continues to be severely affected by the Wolwedans Dam. This dam materially affects the flow of water to maintain the estuary in a healthy condition. This has resulted in a shallowing of the estuary and significant degradation of the water quality over the years which has affected the health, use &amp; enjoyment of the river and contributed to escalating flooding concerns. The reduced river flow impacts the ability of the river to prevent the build up of sand at the river mouth. The consequence of this is the build up of sand from the incoming tides results in the closure of the mouth for extended periods and damming up of the estuary behind a huge wall of sand. This has very significant negative impacts on the estuary and massively elevates flooding risks because river water cannot easily escape to the sea when and if there are good rains.</p> <p><b>Consequently any activity which places more sand at or near the river mouth area will exacerbate an already bad situation and must not be permitted.</b></p> <p>Please confirm that this will not be proposed or implemented</p>	<p>Jeremy S Franklin</p> <p>10 October 2023</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>The Maintenance Management Plan has been amended and no sand will be moved to the river mouth.</p> <p>Please refer page 16 of the amended MMP.</p>

COMMENT	NAME/ORGANISATION	RESPONSE
<p>As a concerned resident of Great Brak River, I wish to <b>lodge my objection</b> to certain aspects of the above plan.</p> <p>I understand the need for the correct management of stormwater drains etc. However, the suggestion to dump and spread sand at the river mouth, p.18, fig. 17, goes against the Mouth Management Plan and all the other surveys done for the Great Brak Estuary. Thousands of rands have been spent on moving sand away from the mouth in an effort to keep the mouth open for longer periods. As environmentalists, you surely do not have to have the reasons for that explained to you!</p> <p>May I suggest that the sand gets spread further away from the mouth, i.e. to the west of the site, where there is not a river mouth nearby.</p>	<p>Denise de Wet</p> <p>10 October 2023</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>The Maintenance Management Plan has been amended and no sand will be moved to the river mouth.</p> <p>Please refer page 16 of the amended MMP.</p>
COMMENT	NAME/ORGANISATION	RESPONSE
<p>The proposed dumping of sand in our Great Brak River mouth for the storm water infrastructure planned at Erf 410 Orion Drive, Suiderkruis, discusses "dumping and spreading" sand at our river mouth.</p> <p>Given the years of all our hard work and massive funding poured into removing the sand that was dumped in the mouth this is shocking. Had the sand not been removed recent events proved our village would've washed away.</p> <p>When the mouth is closed it affects our ability to be insured. That is a serious problem for all concerned.</p> <p>Strongly reject this proposal.</p>	<p>Claire Rayner</p> <p>10 October 2023</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>The Maintenance Management Plan has been amended and no sand will be moved to the river mouth.</p> <p>Please refer page 16 of the amended MMP.</p>
COMMENT	NAME/ORGANISATION	RESPONSE
<p>We have fought &amp; continue to fight a long standing problem with sand being incorrectly dumped at the river mouth for many years when it has been opened. The estuary is only just STARTING to recover, thanks to the recent storm surge &amp; rain. It is still far from what it should</p>	<p>Wendy Searle</p> <p>10 October 2023</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>The Maintenance Management Plan has been amended and no sand will be moved to the river mouth.</p> <p>Please refer page 16 of the amended MMP.</p>

<p>be &amp; there is still a large amount of sand that has to be removed, which comes at a huge cost.</p> <p>With the above in mind, I &amp; I'm sure, the rest of the Island residents, highly object to having more sand being dumped here. Let the developer of Erf 410 kindly find somewhere else to dump their sand. After all, they do not contribute to the costs pertaining to the rehabilitation of the estuary/mouth of the Greatbrak river.</p>		
<b>COMMENT</b>	<b>NAME/ORGANISATION</b>	<b>RESPONSE</b>
<p>The proposal to dump sand at Great Brak River Mouth (section 7.1.2 and figure 17) is in direct contradiction to the Great Brak Estuary EMMP, which states that the sand berm must be maintained at a maximum height of 2m AMSL, and skimmed when it exceeds this height. This activity is paid for by MBM and, on occasion, partially co-funded by SERAG by means of a signed contract between the two. Dumping sand at the river mouth will serve to increase the height of the berm, contradicting the approved EMMP aiming at maintaining the aforementioned height, which will then leave MBM to pay for the removal of said sand and have it placed elsewhere.</p> <p>Any excavated sand should be dumped on the beach below the high-water mark, where the tide/waves, accompanied by the longshore drift, will serve to take it away.</p> <p>For the avoidance of doubt, no sand should ever be dumped at Great Brak Estuary mouth.</p>	<p>Harry Tayler</p> <p>10 October 2023</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>The Maintenance Management Plan has been amended and no sand will be moved to the river mouth.</p> <p>Please refer page 16 of the amended MMP.</p>

<p>I am a homeowner on Great Brak island, and one of the founders of the Southern Estuarine Rehabilitation Action Group NPC (SERAG), a SARS-registered charitable organisation that since 2021 has partnered with Mossel Bay Municipality (MBM) to facilitate - and pay for - the environmental rehabilitation of Great Brak estuary. Herewith my comments on the proposed MMP for ERF-410 (Suiderkruis).</p> <p>The proposal to dump sand at Great Brak River Mouth (section 7.1.2 and figure 17) is in direct contradiction to the Great Brak Estuary EMMP, which states that the sand berm must be maintained at a maximum height of 2m AMSL, and skimmed when it exceeds this height. This activity is paid for by MBM and, on occasion, partially co-funded by SERAG by means of a signed contract between the two. Dumping sand at the river mouth will serve to increase the height of the berm, contradicting the approved EMMP aiming at maintaining the aforementioned height, which will then leave MBM to pay for the removal of said sand and have it placed elsewhere.</p> <p>Any excavated sand should be dumped on the beach below the high-water mark, where the tide/waves, accompanied by the longshore drift, will serve to take it away.</p> <p>For the avoidance of doubt, no sand should ever be dumped at Great Brak Estuary mouth.</p>		
<b>COMMENT</b>	<b>NAME/ORGANISATION</b>	<b>RESPONSE</b>
<p>As the co-owner of a house on the Island, Great Brak River, I must object in the strongest possible terms to an idea in your proposed plan for dealing with a buildup of sand at the sumps on Orion Drive, Southern Cross.</p> <p>The SES plan proposal, "Maintenance Management Plan for the Existing Infrastructure on Erf 410, Orion Drive, Great Brak River, Mossel Bay Municipality, Western Cape"</p>	<p>E A Mackenzie 10 October 2023</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments. The Maintenance Management Plan has been amended and no sand will be moved to the river mouth. Please refer page 16 of the amended MMP.</p>

suggests on page 16 in section "7.1 Clearing the Stormwater Sumps of Sand" that : "A dump truck must be used to transport the sand from the site to the river mouth where it can be dumped and spread, as shown in figure 17." On page 18, the caption to an image says: "Figure 17: Sand from the dump truck must be dumped and spread at the river mouth." This is highly problematic.

It appears that little attention has been paid to the ecology of the Great Brak River and the historical factors that have negatively affected its natural flow.

The building of the Wolwedans dam and the severely limited water flow, which can no longer naturally and regularly scour out sand from the riverbed, has led to decades of increasing sedimentation and higher levels of sand at the river mouth. This has meant that there have been longer and longer periods when the river is completely blocked from the sea and the water cannot flow as it should into and out of the sea.

This, and its negative effects, are especially visible around The Island and the river mouth, for example, a buildup of toxic algae in the river, growth of alien vegetation around the river, and problematic consequences for the growth of juvenile fish, crustaceans and other aquatic species in the blocked estuary, amongst others.

For decades, Island residents have spent much time, energy and money on keeping the sand berm between the sea and the river open. In the last couple of years, extensive efforts have been made to clear sand away from the river mouth to enable a regular flow of water into and out of the sea.

Clearly, having more sand dumped around the river mouth, as per your proposal, will have extremely negative effects on the ecology of the estuary, which has become more fragile in recent years. It will also have



<p>negative effects on properties on The Island when high levels of sand at the river mouth prevent water from escaping out to sea during heavy rains and the water levels rise to the point where properties are flooded.</p> <p>To prevent further negative consequences to the ecology of the Great Brak River and its surrounding environment, it will be critical that the authors of this report find a less harmful way to dispose of the excess sand at the sumps on Orion Drive.</p>		
<b>COMMENT</b>	<b>NAME/ORGANISATION</b>	<b>RESPONSE</b>
<p>I write on behalf of all the residents on The Island, Great Brak River. We object to the 'environment plan' of Sharples to remove sand at Erf 410 and dump and spread it at the Great Brak River mouth.</p> <p>Such action causes all sorts of problems. These include environment, ecological, a risk of flooding, additional costs to the Municipality should a mechanical breeching become necessary, to name but a few. We remain alarmed that an Environmental Services Business could even think of such action!</p> <p>We demand that you immediately change you plan and remove the sand to a place where it can safely be dumped inland.</p> <p>I look forward to your immediate reply consenting not to dump any sand at the Great Brak River mouth, or any beach or any other river mouth or river course.</p>	<p>Steve Beck CHAIRMAN: THE ISLAND RESIDENTS' ASSOCIATION</p> <p>10 October 2023</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments. The Maintenance Management Plan has been amended and no sand will be moved to the river mouth. Please refer page 16 of the amended MMP.</p>
<b>COMMENT</b>	<b>NAME/ORGANISATION</b>	<b>RESPONSE</b>
<p>Having only very recently heard of these intentions in spite of the fact that I represent the Rate Payers Association of Great Brak River, Please allow me the following questions.</p> <p>1. When does the PPP close for comments ? 2. Have you held any public meetings and discussions yet and when did this take place.?</p>	<p>Ronald Hacquebord.</p> <p>10 October 2023</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments. The Maintenance Management Plan has been amended and no sand will be moved to the river mouth. Please refer page 16 of the amended MMP.</p>

<p>3. Will there be future open debate sessions?  4. Did SES suggest the moving of sand to the river mouth after an assessment had been done by your company.?</p> <p>Excuse my ignorance here but I would appreciate your answers to these pertinent questions. Thanks.</p>		
<b>COMMENT</b>	<b>NAME/ORGANISATION</b>	<b>RESPONSE</b>
<p>I hVe a few comments on the dumping of sand in the mouth area of the Great Brak River from the storm water outlets repair.  The river mouth was destroyed by the dumping of sand there by the municipality a few years ago. This has been removed at a huge cost to mainly private citizens. Dumping more sand there will set a president again. Tis sand in turn is blown into the estuary by the prevailing Easterly winds causing the estuary to silt up even more than it already has. This leads to many more problems.</p>	<p>Brian Searle  11 October 2023</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.  The Maintenance Management Plan has been amended and no sand will be moved to the river mouth.  Please refer page 16 of the amended MMP.</p>
<b>COMMENT</b>	<b>NAME/ORGANISATION</b>	<b>RESPONSE</b>
<p>As homeowner on The Island at Great Brak River who has been actively involved in estuarine affairs over the years, I am alarmed that you are proposing to dump sand from Orion Drive in the river mouth. This runs entirely counter to the objectives behind the long extant Maintenance Management Plan for the Artificial Breaching of the Great Brak River Mouth (Mouth Management Plan) which has had years of discussion and input from local stakeholders, and which the Municipality has filed with the Western Cape government.</p> <p>Piling additional dump truck loads of sand from the Orion Drive stormwater outlets into the river mouth is completely at odds with the principles and logistics associated with the Mouth Management Plan, including artificial breaching. The Municipality – as well as local stakeholders – already incurs significant financial costs in removing sand from the river mouth, whether for environmental or emergency breaches. Adding more sand from Orion to that same place (as outlined in this new MMP) means there will be *even more* sand</p>	<p>Richard Sambolec  11 October 2023</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.  The Maintenance Management Plan has been amended and no sand will be moved to the river mouth.  Please refer page 16 of the amended MMP.</p>

<p>requiring removal from the mouth, with the same sand being moved twice: first from Orion to the mouth, and then again, when it is trucked away from the mouth during breaching activities. How can this double work be justified from a fiscal viewpoint? Importantly, it also exacerbates many of the safety and evacuation issues that led to the creation of the Mouth Maintenance Plan in the first place, particularly during emergency breaches where the water is high, time is short, and equipment is located far away.</p> <p>Furthermore, there may be instances where the two Management Plans (the Orion Stormwater Infrastructure and the Mouth Management) will be in direct conflict. Not just in principle, as I've outlined above, but also in terms of actual implementation. What if, under your proposal, the Orion sand must be moved to the river mouth *at the same time* that the mouth is being breached (or where a breach is being planned), with sand being removed from there under the direction of the Mouth Management Plan? While this extreme scenario illustrates how nonsensical the proposal is, it should be equally clear that *any additional sand* dumped in the river mouth is just more sand that will have to be removed during subsequent breaching activities, regardless of when that sand is deposited there.</p> <p>The proposed Stormwater Infrastructure MMP fails to take any of this into account.</p> <p>I trust you will revise your proposed MMP to incorporate a more suitable location for any sand removed from Orion.</p>		
<b>COMMENT</b>	<b>NAME/ORGANISATION</b>	<b>RESPONSE</b>
<p>As a resident of Great Brak, I wish to lend my support to The Island Residents Association and their concerns. Any proposed action which has a hint of a possible complexity in keeping the mouth open (Yes, I'm aware of tidal action), ought to be reconsidered. In the spirit of</p>	<p>Hartog Blok</p> <p>11 October 2023</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>The Maintenance Management Plan has been amended and no sand will be moved to the river mouth.</p> <p>Please refer page 16 of the amended MMP.</p>

<p>assisting, I am aware that residents of Great Brak Heights will reach out and gratefully accept many loads of sand on the assumption that this action isn't in conflict with an environmental consequence.</p>		
<b>COMMENT</b>	<b>NAME/ORGANISATION</b>	<b>RESPONSE</b>
<p>We as residents of Great Brak and residing close to the river mouth, do not support dumping of sand near any estuary/river mouth. Any sand deposited in the Great Brak River mouth, negates all efforts over the last few years to keep the mouth open.</p> <p>Please add myself and husband as interested parties.</p>	<p>An-Mari Badenhorst</p> <p>11 October 2023</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>The Maintenance Management Plan has been amended and no sand will be moved to the river mouth.</p> <p>Please refer page 16 of the amended MMP.</p>
<b>COMMENT</b>	<b>NAME/ORGANISATION</b>	<b>RESPONSE</b>
<p>Our family object to the 'environment plan' of Sharplees to remove sand at Erf 410 and dump and spread it at the Great Brak River mouth.</p> <p>Such action causes all sorts of problems. These include environment, ecological, a risk of flooding, additional costs to the Municipality should a mechanical breaching become necessary, to name but a few. We remain alarmed that an Environmental Services Business could even think of such action!</p> <p>Our family demand that you immediately change you plan and remove the sand to a place where it can safely be dumped inland.</p> <p>Please do not to dump any sand at the Great Brak River mouth.</p>	<p>Josey du Plooy</p> <p>11 October 2023</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>The Maintenance Management Plan has been amended and no sand will be moved to the river mouth.</p> <p>Please refer page 16 of the amended MMP.</p>
<b>COMMENT</b>	<b>NAME/ORGANISATION</b>	<b>RESPONSE</b>
<p>I object to any dumping of sand near any estuary and especially the very sensitive great brak estuary. Please add me as an interested party.</p>	<p>Timothy de Vos</p> <p>11 October 2023</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>The Maintenance Management Plan has been amended and no sand will be moved to the river mouth.</p> <p>Please refer page 16 of the amended MMP.</p>

COMMENT	NAME/ORGANISATION	RESPONSE
<p>I would like to add my voice to the chorus of objections to the dumping of sand at the Great Brak River mouth.</p> <p>The estuary has already suffered much with the building of the dam upstream and any more damage to the area around the river mouth would be disastrously detrimental to that sensitive ecosystem, which supports so much life.</p>	<p>Melanie Harris</p> <p>11 October 2023</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>The Maintenance Management Plan has been amended and no sand will be moved to the river mouth.</p> <p>Please refer page 16 of the amended MMP.</p>
COMMENT	NAME/ORGANISATION	RESPONSE
<p>I strongly object to the proposal.</p> <p>It will have a negative effect on the estuary.</p>	<p>Dave Laity</p> <p>11 October 2023</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>The Maintenance Management Plan has been amended and no sand will be moved to the river mouth.</p> <p>Please refer page 16 of the amended MMP.</p>
COMMENT	NAME/ORGANISATION	RESPONSE
<p>Is the proposer aware of the enormous effort and expense just recently conducted - and only just in time - to REMOVE the excess sand buildup at this very location as a joint effort by the Great Brak River Island residents and Mossel Bay municipality? This buildup has taken place over the last few years as a consequence of reduced flow to the river resulting from the Wolwedans dam. The important points to notice are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• typical river flow is no longer sufficient to remove the natural buildup of sand at the river mouth</li> <li>• as the level of sand rises, effectively damming the river, all houses on the The Island and those close to the river upstream, especially in the village of Great Brak River are increasingly in danger of flooding (as has just once again happened), both from general backing up of the river, but especially when rain comes raising the level of the river rapidly while it is unable to break out to the sea in time</li> </ul> <p>Note that I say "just in time" above, since this was done last year just before the rains started which would unquestionably have flooded the Island and village.</p>	<p>Edmund Franklin</p> <p>11 October 2023</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>The Maintenance Management Plan has been amended and no sand will be moved to the river mouth.</p> <p>Please refer page 16 of the amended MMP.</p>

<p>Given these circumstances, it simply begs belief that the notion of bringing more sand to this area should be given any consideration at all, let alone be specifically recommended.</p> <p>I, therefore, object to this suggestion on the strongest possible terms and insist that you modify this recommendation to remove the sand to a safe inland location..</p>		
<b>COMMENT</b>	<b>NAME/ORGANISATION</b>	<b>RESPONSE</b>
<p>As a resident on The Island, Great Brak River, I strongly object to the proposed environmental plan of Sharples to remove sand at Erf 410, Orion Drive, Suiderkruis, and dump and spread it at the Great Brak River mouth.</p> <p>This action will have an extremely detrimental impact on the river and environment and will substantially increase the risk of flooding, not to mention possible costs for the municipality to hire equipment should mechanical breaching become necessary. For that matter, the sand cannot be dumped at any beach, river mouth or river course.</p> <p>It is a great concern that a company, with experts in the Environmental field, even consider such an action as a viable solution.</p> <p>Surely there are less sensitive areas where the sand can be dumped safely. Herewith then an urgent request to immediately amend the proposed plan to an action with minimal impact on the environment.</p> <p>Looking forward to your response agreeing not to dump any sand at the Great Brak River mouth, or similar area as indicated above.</p>	<p>Rica le Roux</p> <p>11 October 2023</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>The Maintenance Management Plan has been amended and no sand will be moved to the river mouth.</p> <p>Please refer page 16 of the amended MMP.</p>

COMMENT	NAME/ORGANISATION	RESPONSE
<p>I wish to object to any sand being dumped at the Great Brak/Suiderkruis river mouth.</p> <p>The development of Hersham and the Wolwedans Dam have affected the natural processes of the natural periodic closing and opening of the river mouth, making it extremely subject to high sand berms. Sand now tends to having a much more adverse affect on the river flow. All these considerations cannot be dealt with in detail in this email, but its severe impact on the proper river management makes it quite extraordinary that any decision of this nature should not have been subjected to a detailed analysis by all who are involved in the management of the Great Brak River estuary. Factors like the effect of wind on dumped sand must, as an example, be taken into account apart from its immediate effect on the river flow.</p> <p>I speak with some authority of experience in having served in, or co-operated with, GEC (Great Brak Environmental Committee) since building of the Wolwedans Dam and later in GDF where the expert advice of the CSIR in the persons of Messrs Huizenga and Kriel from DWAF and of subsidiary contributors were instrumental in establishing strict guidelines. This is not respected by the present intensions to dump sand at the estuary.</p>	<p>H NICO LE ROUX</p> <p>11 October 2023</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>The Maintenance Management Plan has been amended and no sand will be moved to the river mouth.</p> <p>Please refer page 16 of the amended MMP.</p>
<p>I would hereby like to oppose these actions strongly and cannot believe that this proposal stems from an 'environmental sensitive' company.</p> <p>Specially after the recent high sea we experienced. This makes this proposal even more ridiculous.</p> <p>Please make sure that we are updated on the more responsible actions that will be considered.</p>		

<p>I wish to object to any sand being dumped at the Great Brak/Suiderkruis river mouth. Sand will not add to better flow nor will it serve as protection against sea tides due to a number of considerations which cannot be dealt with in this time schedule. Severely impact on proper river management.</p> <p>I speak with some authority of experience having served in GEC en the GBR Forum (GOF) since building of the Wolwedans Dam and with the expert advice of the CSIR in the persons of Messrs Huizenga and Kriel from DAWF.</p>		
<b>COMMENT</b>	<b>NAME/ORGANISATION</b>	<b>RESPONSE</b>
<p>The development of Hersham and the Wolwedans Dam have affected the natural processes of the natural periodic closing and opening of the river mouth, making it extremely subject to high sand berms. Sand now tends to having a much more adverse affect on the river flow. All these considerations cannot be dealt with in detail in this email, but its severe impact on the proper river management makes it quite extraordinary that any decision of this nature should not have been subjected to a detailed analysis by all who are involved in the management of the Great Brak River estuary. Factors like the effect of wind on dumped sand must, as an example, be taken into account apart from its immediate effect on the river flow.</p> <p>I speak with some authority of experience in having served in, or co-operated with, GEC (Great Brak Environmental Committee) since building of the Wolwedans Dam and later in GDF where the expert advice of the CSIR in the persons of Messrs Huizenga and Kriel from DWAF and of subsidiary contributors were instrumental in establishing strict guidelines. This is not respected by the present intensions to dump sand at the estuary.</p>	<p>Danie le Roux</p> <p>11 October 2023</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>The Maintenance Management Plan has been amended and no sand will be moved to the river mouth.</p> <p>Please refer page 16 of the amended MMP.</p>
<b>COMMENT</b>	<b>NAME/ORGANISATION</b>	<b>RESPONSE</b>
<p>I strongly object to the above plan. For years we have been trying to keep the mouth open as long as possible because we have had floods on our properties. Now with</p>	<p>Martin VJ van Vuuren.</p> <p>11 October 2023</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>The Maintenance Management Plan has been amended and no sand will be moved to the river mouth.</p>



<p>the plan with EREF 410, it will endanger our houses, as it already happened this year and in 2011.</p>		<p>Please refer page 16 of the amended MMP.</p>
<b>COMMENT</b>	<b>NAME/ORGANISATION</b>	<b>RESPONSE</b>
<p>It is with the utmost disbelief that I learned of the proposal by SHARPLES to dump and spread sand at the Great Brak River mouth!!</p> <p>It is extraordinary that an Environmental Company would consider something that is so obviously detrimental to the environment, specifically at the mouth of a river which supports so many ecosystems.</p> <p>As an Environmental Services Company surely you are aware of the issues with the river mouth closing and having to be opened. There is no scenario where adding more sand will be beneficial. It will be detrimental in every aspect.</p> <p>Bringing in additional sand serves absolutely NO positive purpose.</p> <p>Please, please, please do not attempt to destroy this already fragile situation.</p>	<p>Elizabeth Franklin</p> <p>11 October 2023</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>The Maintenance Management Plan has been amended and no sand will be moved to the river mouth.</p> <p>Please refer page 16 of the amended MMP.</p>
<b>COMMENT</b>	<b>NAME/ORGANISATION</b>	<b>RESPONSE</b>
<p>I am writing to you with concerns regarding the Storm Water Infrastructure at ERF410, Orion Drive, Suiderkruis plan. I am expressing these concerns as an individual with a master's in Marine Biodiversity and Conservation and a long-term resident and owner of property in the Suiderkruis area and Great Brak Island.</p> <p>Firstly, I would like to commend you on a well-written report. However, your proposed maintenance plan for Sump 1 would introduce environmental and financial impacts to the Great Brak River mouth if the proposed plan involves dumping the dredged sand into the river mouth.</p>	<p>Inge Deschepper</p> <p>11 October 2023</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>The Maintenance Management Plan has been amended and no sand will be moved to the river mouth.</p> <p>Please refer page 16 of the amended MMP.</p>

Your proposed plan that involves work at the road-side of the dune at Sump site one and the dumping of the dredged sand into the Great Brak River mouth (figure 17 on page 18 of the MMP) is missing a vital assessment of the environmental impact it would have on the estuary and the ecosystem associated to it. It is clear that within the law, the maintenance should have as minimal impact on the dumping areas as it would the areas you dredge the sand from. If the plan is to dump the sand in the above-mentioned area, an Environmental Impact Assessment should be done.

Furthermore, the Great Brak River mouth experiences a cycle of opening and closing depending on the storm surge and spring tide patterns. In most years, this would not occur (2023 being an anomalous year of heavy rainfall); therefore, to freshen up the estuary and maintain a healthy ecosystem, the river mouth has to be dredged open by the municipality. Dumping extra sand at the river mouth would first impede the mouth's natural ability to open on its own, which is the most ideal situation, and it would also add additional financial cost to move that sand once again to open the river mouth.

Additionally, I assume this plan is based on a long-term maintenance plan; it is essential to note that in the years to come, there is no guarantee that we will have as high rainfall as we have experienced this year (2023) to naturally open the river mouth as we are heading into the El Niño phase of the ENSO cycle that is usually associated with draught and decreased rainfall for South Africa and particularly this region.

The plan proposed for maintenance on the beachfront of sump site 1 (figure 19 on page 19 of the MMP) would be the most ideal solution to the above-mentioned issue. Dumping and spreading the sand along the beachfront between the two sump sites would, firstly, reduce the environmental impact of the dumping site at the mouth

of an estuary. It would secondly reduce the distance that the sand is dumped from the original dredging site.		
<b>COMMENT</b>	<b>NAME/ORGANISATION</b>	<b>RESPONSE</b>
<p>I strongly object to sand being dumped near the Great Brak River mouth.</p> <p>The repercussion to the environment and especially the river mouth, which is already an extremely sensitive area, could be disastrously damaging.</p>	<p>Cecily Hulley</p> <p>11 October 2023</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>The Maintenance Management Plan has been amended and no sand will be moved to the river mouth.</p> <p>Please refer page 16 of the amended MMP.</p>
<b>COMMENT</b>	<b>NAME/ORGANISATION</b>	<b>RESPONSE</b>
<p>I write on behalf of our property on The Island, Great Brak River to object to the 'environment plan' of Sharples to remove sand at Erf 410 and dump and spread it at the Great Brak River mouth.</p> <p>Such action causes all sorts of problems. These include environment, ecological, a risk of flooding, additional costs to the Municipality should a mechanical breaching become necessary, to name but a few. We remain alarmed that an Environmental Services Business could even think of such action! Particularly considering the current problems being experienced where sand has been removed - now you want to import more?</p> <p>We demand that you immediately change your plan and remove the sand to a place where it can safely be dumped inland.</p> <p>I look forward to your immediate reply, consenting not to dump any sand at the Great Brak River mouth, or any beach or any other river mouth or river course.</p>	<p>Brian Sterley</p> <p>11 October 2023</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>The Maintenance Management Plan has been amended and no sand will be moved to the river mouth.</p> <p>Please refer page 16 of the amended MMP.</p>
<b>COMMENT</b>	<b>NAME/ORGANISATION</b>	<b>RESPONSE</b>
<p>We as owners of a property on the Island object strongly against any sand dropped at the mouth of the Great Brak River.</p> <p>We cannot believe that educated people will make this decision.</p>	<p>Wilhelm Lochner and Tinka Joynt</p> <p>12 October 2023</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments.</p> <p>The Maintenance Management Plan has been amended and no sand will be moved to the river mouth.</p> <p>Please refer page 16 of the amended MMP.</p>

Please drop the unwanted sand somewhere else.		
<b>COMMENT</b>	<b>NAME/ORGANISATION</b>	<b>RESPONSE</b>
<p>On behalf of, 'the interested and affected parties ' , who has a share in property on the Island, Great Brak River ; I strongly object to this proposed 'environmental plan' of dumping sand at the Great Brak River mouth and estuary.</p> <p>I am astounded that this could even be contemplated !! After many , many hours of meetings and discussions , with reference to the existing Mouth Management Plan , and the sensitivity around the process of managing the estuary and river with utmost care ( as agreed to by all the different parties/representative bodies and levels of local government involved at these meetings ); ...this is surely not considered as a solution.!? Quite frankly , in my opinion , this approach smacks of ignorance or incompetence...or both.</p>	<p>Carel du Plessis</p> <p>12 October 2023</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments. The Maintenance Management Plan has been amended and no sand will be moved to the river mouth. Please refer page 16 of the amended MMP.</p>
<b>COMMENT</b>	<b>NAME/ORGANISATION</b>	<b>RESPONSE</b>
<p>I am deeply concerned about this dumping (frankly any dumping, with its obvious connotation of thoughtlessness conkers me). Please send me a link that will better inform me of the context.</p>	<p>Johnny Johnson</p> <p>12 October 2023</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments. The Maintenance Management Plan has been amended and no sand will be moved to the river mouth. Please refer page 16 of the amended MMP.</p>
<b>COMMENT</b>	<b>NAME/ORGANISATION</b>	<b>RESPONSE</b>
<p>Can you reassure that it will also not be in within a kilometre of either side of the mouth.</p>	<p>Guy Harris</p> <p>13 October 2023</p>	<p>Thank you for your comments. The Maintenance Management Plan has been amended and no sand will be moved to the river mouth. Please refer page 16 of the amended MMP.</p>